

Citizenship Study Group

Minutes of the 4th meeting of the study group held in Dunedin, New Zealand, from 13-15 August 2007

Present: Nicola Taylor and Anne Smith (CIC, New Zealand); Anne Graham, Brad Shipway and Robyn Fitzgerald (CCYP, Australia), Håvard Bjerke (NOSEB, Norway) and Udi Butler (CIESPI, Brazil).

Apologies: Irene Rizzini (CIESPI, Brazil), Anne Trine Kjørholt (NOSEB, Norway), Mohammed Shaheen (Palestine) and Rose September (South Africa).

Country Updates

Each country gave a brief update of the activities they had been involved with on the citizenship project since the last meeting in Roros, Norway. This mainly involved administering the parent/teacher questionnaires (Brazil and South Africa); undertaking conference presentations (Norway and NZ); writing articles for publication (NZ); and writing the chapters for the research report (everyone).

Brad and Anne Trine had produced an annotated bibliography which Håvard and Anne Smith subsequently drew on for the literature review chapter.

Håvard reported on his involvement since the Roros meeting as a PhD student at NOSEB where he is working on a subproject of the *Children as New Citizens* research programme funded by the Norwegian Research Council. Håvard has listened to all the original tapes and gone over the transcripts + doubled the sample since Jan 2007 by undertaking additional focus groups in the same Norwegian schools. He has also conducted individual interviews with some children and made home visits where he has talked with their parents. This new data will be used to extend the findings from the original sample and will be written up for his PhD thesis.

Udi said that they had now collected questionnaire data from parents/teachers, which is written in Portugese, and that he would look at adding some of this to the Brazil chapter. He also talked about two other participation projects he had been involved with.

Draft Citizenship Research Report

We went through the draft report, chapter by chapter, and noted those sections that needed amendment. We also identified the common and unique features of each country's data and noted aspects we specifically wanted to emphasise in the final chapter:

	Common things across Country Studies	Unique things
AUSTRALIA		
National	<p>In each country there is an influence of socio-political context (even though the influence itself came from very different quarters)</p> <p>Socio - Political Context:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - There is a current high-profile initiative on the explicit teaching of “Australian” values - Rights are “threatening” to parents & teachers – represent a possible dilution of parental and teacher authority - Citizenship is a major contemporary (and explicit) political focus - No Federal Children’s Commission or Ombudsman <p>As a result there is a corresponding explicit (and heavily funded) Curriculum focus</p> <p>Children’s Reports</p> <p>Overriding concern for safety</p> <p>Freedom from discrimination (with the exception of the children in Brazil – favela children)</p> <p>Concern for the environment</p>	<p>Curriculum</p> <p>Values</p> <p>Suspicion/reservation around rights</p> <p>Emphasis on care – responsibility – eg for environment, pets, elders, siblings</p>
Generational difference?	<p>“Confusion” about the way citizenship is conceptualized</p> <p>Rights are threatening</p> <p>Gap between experience and ideal of citizenship e.g. p 56 Brazil - NZ – p 96 We should have heaps more rights than we currently do – we want power”</p>	<p>Sophistication around the way citizenship is imagined by the children</p>
<p>FINAL CHAPTER NOTES</p> <p>Flags</p> <p>Strong theme of care – plus see lit review on p 28</p>		
BRAZIL		
National	<p>Socio – Political context</p> <p>Citizenship and rights are experienced through lack (ie do not belong)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - not through any notions of ‘harmony’ of “good citizenship – relates to difference-centred notions of citizenship. 	<p>Voices of marginalized children</p> <p>Gender issues</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - sexuality (openness) - responsibility for birth control for girls – boys did not talk about this as much - chores

	<p>Children's reports Schools constrain their practice of rights</p> <p>Aspirational aspects of citizenship</p>	<p>Influence of their socio-political environment</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - kids talk frankly about poverty but also hold aspirational ideals of changing their circumstances - extreme poverty - inequality - state provision reference to right to access toilets - prejudice certain groups face <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - reference to uniform, getting on buses - racism <p>Quotes for last chapter</p>
Generational difference?	Distinguish between rights and responsibilities between of children and adults	
<p>Notes for final chapter:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Experience and everyday experience of citizenship p 68 “The right to get on the bus and go to school” “The right to sleep” • Overlap between belonging and responsibility p 69 “The citizen worries about the rights of all other citizens” 		
NEW ZEALAND		
National	<p>Socio-political context:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - opportunities for participation - Government in response to UN Report - Agenda for Children - Office of the Children's Commissioner 	<p>Children's participation rights salient</p> <p>Being a NZer</p>
Generational difference?		<p>Strong support for children's rights – high % of adults support children's citizenship/rights</p> <p>Contradicts UNCRC lack of support</p>
<p>Notes for final chapter</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • When does one become a citizen? • Development of rules in relation to process – who got the land by the sea p 93 – older girls • Cultural/political context – strong leadership on rights • Lessons for democracy – how do we teach children to have a say, dimensions of citizenships – how to have an argument – how decision making comes about – how to ‘do’ inclusion – schools are a model for children • Once again – models of citizenship are learned through what citizenship is not • If we do not sort out these sorts of issues around authority, power – constraints around pedagogy – if we are talking about shaping children's understanding - then we need to know more about the adults understanding and practice of citizenship • Support and professional development to teach this. • Brad: If we teach the spirit rather than the principles of citizenship and participation then we open Pandora's box – Kids will practice their first lessons in the classroom! <p>Only learn about participation by participating - Bordenave quote from Udi</p>		

NORWAY		
National	<p>Socio-political context</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Norway's contribution to foreign aid - Discussion: is the idea of children having a say going too far? - Participation rights to have a say - <p>National Ombudsman – children have a high profile</p> <p>Age differences – more about the day to day concerns that children have competence</p> <p>Social political emphasis on helping others</p>	<p>Case Study:</p> <p>Children raise voices and said what they thought – OK to speak up in opposition - teaching to the spirit of citizenship is being “done” respectfully?</p> <p>Language of citizenship –</p> <p>Right to have feelings – to be angry or sad</p> <p>Ambivalence towards participation – children don't necessarily want those responsibilities - to be free to play</p> <p>International/global focus – e.g. p 109i – so that people in other countries are not going to starve to death</p>
<p>Notes for final chapter <u>P128</u></p> <p>Ambiguity - - between what children think they should have and what they want</p> <p>Ambivalence – being pulled two ways</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - about responsibility - among children's experiences– p 128 – what importance does this ambiguity have for the institutional practice of Cultural – historical discourses – emergence of notions of citizenship from law of contract and torts <p>Age of acquisition of rights – right to vote c/f/ age of consent and criminal liability</p> <p>See reference to ambivalence – South Africa p 159</p>		
PALESTINE		
Nationality	Safety	<p>What could the study group have done to support the collection of data – e.g flags confiscated at the border, children's fear of tape recording</p> <p>Assistance for transcription of data</p> <p>Issues of language – all data in Arabic</p> <p>See three quotes or at the end</p> <p>Defending your Country Effect of Conflict/Occupation Completely different dimensions of Safety in play – threat to life</p>
SOUTH AFRICA		
Nationality	Socio-cultural context	Obeying rules and being obedient – p

	<p>African childhood – not western but collective approach to community – preservation of group identity</p> <p>Democratic government c/f family and schools</p> <p>Right to be educated – to be taught –</p> <p>Freedom of expression</p> <p>Right to have an opinion</p> <p>Right to justice and fairness</p> <p>More positive rights, to ideas, talent to reach potential</p>	<p>156</p> <p>Don't talk much about participation rights</p> <p>Importance of responsibility – p defining citizenship in terms for responsibility p 145</p> <p>Right to be disciplined fairly</p> <p>Safety /protection from crime</p>
<p>Notes for final chapter A good citizen does not take the law into their own hands p 152; p 156</p>		

Themes emerging from the chapters

Dimensions of Citizenship:

Rights and duties
Participation
Identity and belonging
Nationality
Positioning of children
Respect
Recognition
Distribution resources connection

Importance of local context:

Climate – social, political, sociocultural, ecological
Curriculum – school context
Each country had a different socio-political context playing out

Generation differences – where do they fit in?

The personal and the abstract:

Day-to-day lives of children – concrete examples from each country
Literature – levels of understanding
Methodology of imaginary country exercise – easier for children to engage with issues here
Diversity of children's accounts
Overriding concern for safety, for the environment and for freedom from discrimination

Power dynamics: the language; talking to children
Confusion around the concept of citizenship

Methodological lessons learnt:

Qualitative cross-cultural comparative study
Access to marginalised children
Discourse of protection
Ethical challenges
Working in different languages
Problematic definitions
Nation building aspect under-explored
Changing personnel within the study group over time
People who collected data did not necessarily write it up

Implications for policy and practice:

Education – Curriculum, teachers and pre-service teachers
Community organizations – those who are involved in planning and policy
Lawyers, social workers, civic planners, NGOs, parents
How the policy context affects children's understanding

Aspects unique to our study:

True international perspective
What this means for the field
IEA study now very old – our data is more current
Our study is qualitative; whereas most others are quantitative
Capacity-building role of Childwatch and what it means to collaborate internationally
Citizenship as difference; as a lack of resources; learning about rights through what you don't have; not always the harmonious concept of being a citizen – rights can be threatening
Role of schools in enhancing or constraining children's rights
Constructions of childhood and children's experiences
How policy and law influence children's citizenship

Impact of the citizenship project:

It has stimulated a lot of other activities within our Centres e.g. Udi and Håvard's research; major funding applications by NOSEB and CIC

Refinement of our thinking – interchange of terminology – what is meant by citizenship, participation and a children's rights agenda? Appropriation / misappropriation of terminology

Explosion of literature and research on citizenship since the London meeting

Finding a way to make strengths out of the study's weaknesses – not accessing other aspects of children's lives (although Håvard is doing this with his PhD)

Things have we learnt that could improve practices and policies to support children's citizenship? We have learnt:**Some methodological lessons:**

- *about doing qualitative research with children.* What works/What doesn't? (e.g. smaller focus groups, repeated visits to build trust and dialogue, taking children's data as it is presented).

- *about doing research across countries*. What works/What doesn't. (e.g. making assumptions about the capacity of some countries to conduct and plan/drive the research process). What things would we NOT recommend to anyone else?

We have learnt:

- Things about the **language** used to talk about the concept of children's citizenship
- Things about the dynamics of **power relationships** at home and at school
- Things about the problems with **accessing marginalized children** (with the exception of Brazil) – the discourse of protection functions to restrict the dissemination of marginalized children's voices.

Publication of the Research Report as a Book

Wendy Harrex, from the University of Otago Press, met with the study group members and discussed the publication of the research report as a book. This was agreed to by all present with the new title suggested as *Children as Citizens? International Voices*. The deadline for the manuscript being delivered to the Press is **20 December 2007**. Wendy suggested that all authors review their chapters to make them more accessible to readers i.e. remove jargon, simplify language, use interesting chapters titles, headings, tables etc. The publisher will take responsibility for dissemination of the book through their distributors in NZ, Australia, North America, UK and Europe. We also hope to formally launch the book at the Childwatch Key Institutions meeting in 2008.

Cover design - Brad will locate the original flag drawings from the Australian children, and get permission from the children and parents for their possible use.

Nicki to follow up with Wendy about the cover, title and timeframe.

Completion of the Chapters

Preliminary sections: Everyone to check they are happy with their bio and the information included on their Centre; Irene to email through the Foreword.

Chapter 1: Nicki to finalise

Chapter 2: Håvard to finalise

Chapter 3: Anne to finalise – add in material about focus groups, research with children, and note the more detailed information on method in each country chapter. Reference to be made to appendices containing focus group protocol and parent/teacher questionnaires.

Chapters 4-9: the authors from each country to take responsibility for the final proofread of, and edits to, their chapter (bearing in mind the publisher's comments about accessibility of language and style).

Chapter 8: Palestine chapter – we wondered whether Mohammed (or Maisa if she is still available) could re-look at their data and provide some more quotes from the children to include in this chapter; and also some reflections on the

particular difficulties faced in undertaking the research in Palestine (such as the children's flag drawings being confiscated when Mohammed, Ziad and Maisa travelled to Rio de Janeiro etc). Given the sample size of 181 children, the chapter would benefit greatly from the addition of some new material and elaboration of the bullet points on each page.

Chapter 10 (Final Chapter): the sections to be written were divided up between those present at the Dunedin meeting:

- Key themes within and between countries - similarities and differences; link to chapter 2 lit review and look at ways that citizenship and participation have been problematised and need further refinement – *Anne Smith*
- Methodological lessons learnt + issues raised about the possibilities and the challenges of collaborating internationally across different cultures – *Anne Smith*
- Dimensions of citizenship – power relations, participation, agency – *Udi and Håvard*
- Implications for policy and practice – *Anne Graham, Brad and Robyn*
- Where to from here? Everyone to identify a couple of significant issues they consider need further exploration in the future e.g. what issues have we uncovered from our research and review of the literature that would benefit from further enquiry?

Each person is to also identify important issues for future research in this field. Everyone to send through any additional politico-cultural contextual information that is important, but was not included in the Country reports.

Appendices: new appendices to be included showing the history of the project 2003-2007, the original focus group protocol and parent/teacher questionnaires. Nicki to finalise the appendices.

These updates and new sections are to be forwarded to Nicki **by 10 October 2007**. She will then collate the report into its near-final draft and circulate this to everyone again.

Meeting in Australia

Several members of the Citizenship study group (Anne Smith, Anne Graham, Brad Shipway, Robyn Fitzgerald, Anne Trine Kjørholt and Nicola Taylor) will be in Lismore, Australia, in late October 2007 (mainly for the Childwatch rural childhood study group meeting) being hosted by the CCYP. This will provide an opportunity to meet together on **Sunday 28 October** (date to be confirmed) to discuss the draft of the final chapter and the citizenship book more generally.

Journal Publications and Conference Presentations

Each country agreed to keep working on publishing articles and undertaking conference presentations on their citizenship data.

Nicki and Anne presented a paper on the study at a Children's Rights conference at Brock University, Canada, in July 2005. They also have a paper on the NZ citizenship data appearing shortly in the *International Journal of Children's Rights*. Håvard has made presentations at research seminars at NOSEB and the University of Bergen, and will shortly be presenting at the ESA conference in Glasgow.

A conference of potential interest next year is the 2nd *International Conference on Representing Childhood and Youth* being convened by the Centre for the Study of Childhood and Youth at the University of Sheffield, England, from 8-10 July 2008. Abstracts are due by 31 Jan 2008.

See <http://www.cscy.group.shef.ac.uk/conference/index.htm>

UK Participation Network

Udi offered to act as a link between our study group and the participation network being facilitated by Kay Tisdall and others in the UK.

Ideas for Further Action/Future Projects

Possible Future Topics

Nationality issues

Curriculum issues

Link children (aged around 12 yrs) up across countries (would need translators for some countries e.g. Brazil, South Africa, Palestine)

Collaboration with other Childwatch study groups

Seek funding to enable dialogue between groups and possible joint projects

Childwatch Study Groups that we are aware of:

- Feran Casas – Children and the Media (publication)
- Louise Chawla – Children Growing up in Cities
- Mark Small - Rural Childhood
- CIC / CCYP - Children and the law
- The South East Asian participation study group
- Children's spiritualiy

UK funding bid by the research network on children's participation involving South Africa, India, Brazil and Oxford – series of meetings – Udi involved in this. Kay Tisdall (Edinburgh) is the convenor.

Proposed 2008 meeting of all the Childwatch study groups at the time of the KI meeting

Given that Key Institutions will be meeting together next year, the Citizenship Study Group thought this would provide a timely opportunity for all the Childwatch study groups to meet together (either immediately prior to or following the KI meeting) at a seminar. This would enable the lessons learnt from the various study groups to be shared and dialogue to occur on possible collaborations between previous, existing (and new) study groups. At the *Childhoods 2005* conference in Oslo the study groups

met individually, but not together, so it would be useful to now plan for study groups to meet up at a Childwatch-organised seminar.

The members of the citizenship group felt that we had learnt a huge amount about the strengths and challenges of collaborative cross-cultural research and we would be willing to prepare a paper for this seminar and to lead discussion on various considerations concerning research within the Childwatch International Research Network e.g.

- Methodological considerations
- Lessons learnt from cross-country collaborative research
- Ethical issues
- Accessing marginalized children
- Knowledge transferred from research to policy to practice
- Capacity building
- Greater Involvement of majority world

We also thought it was important for other countries to have an opportunity to become involved in any further phase of our project, and for links with the other relevant projects (e.g. the one on participation) to be more directly explored. We are mindful of the fact that Childwatch cannot sustain an ever-increasing number of projects, and so some consideration about the focus of existing study groups may be timely.

None of us knew when the KI meeting was being held, although there was some talk that it may be in Africa in November 2008. Irene or Jon-K can probably inform us about the plans for this meeting.

It was also suggested that the Citizenship study group could launch our book *Children as Citizen? International Voices* at this seminar or the KI meeting.

Timeline

20 August 2007 - Nicki to email minutes of our meeting and the latest Word file of the book draft to study group members

By 10 October – email Nicki with final country chapters and any changes to our biographies + the draft final chapter:

- Chapter 1: Nicki
- Chapter 2: Håvard
- Chapter 3: Anne Smith
- Chapters 4-9: Re-worked Country Chapters – Australia; Brazil, NZ, Norway, Palestine, South Africa
- Chapter 10: Draft sections of Final Chapter from Anne S / Anne G, Brad and Robyn / Udi and Håvard

28 October – Southern Cross University, Lismore, Australia - Nicki, Anne S, Anne G, Brad, Robyn & Anne Trine to meet to discuss and finalise the book draft

20 December – Final date to deliver book manuscript to University of Otago Press

2008

Early January 2008 – Nicki to submit an application to Childwatch in the January 2008 funding round for money to enable the Citizenship study group members to meet up at the time of the KI meeting and proposed study group seminar.

31 January 2008 - Sheffield conference abstracts close

Later in 2008 - Childwatch Key Institutions meeting (?in Africa) + proposed seminar for Childwatch study groups